

Making Machine-Matzah Lishma

מאת הרב צבי איינשטטר

The topic of “Machine-Matzah” could actually take a few Shabbos Hagadol Drashos to cover. In this shiur, we will try to cover a few of the issues in the short amount of time we have. It used to be that the main issue of machine-matzah was chometz problems. We find in דברי חיים א”ח and in תשובה אבני נזר א”ח סימן תקלו a concern for the machines to be incapable of preventing chometz. These problems are long gone due to the advancement of technology. The כתב סופר writes in תשובות נוספות ס”ב that because of his lack of manpower he therefore used machines to make his matzah as they prevented the dough from rising. The main issue nowadays is making these matzos “lishma.” חרש שוטה פסקנים that ערוך ס”י ת”ס cannot make matzos kosher for the Seder because the matzos must be made lishma as the posuk says ושמרתם את המצות- שתהא שימור לשם מצוה We know that a machine does not have any more דעת than a חרש שוטה וקטן, therefore many אחרונים discuss the problem of lishma when making machine-matzah. We will try to cover the four main approaches in avoiding (or solving) this issue.

The first היתר is that of the יג תנינא סי יג. He says an important rule in posuk terminology. When the word “עשיה” is used by the Torah we require the action in question to be performed by the person himself. By the mitzvah of מצה it merely says ושמרתם את המצות. While it is true that we darshen that to necessitate the element of lishma, it would be enough for the overseer to designate the matzos as lishma. Therefore, as long as you have adult Jews controlling the machinery and serving as the גורם/גרמי of the matzah, they are implanting the lishma even though they are not baking it personally (by hand). This היתר is mentioned by many poskim such as in ס”י ס”י. [In הר צבי א”ח סי יג he says that this would even apply to ציצת- to manufacture the strings with machinery as long as the manufacturer is a Jew who declares the work to be lishma, because the posuk doesn’t say “עשיה”. The ה צבי א”ח takes exception to this because the Torah does say ועשו להם ציצת, but that is not our issue to discuss.]

number two is that of the איש חזון. In ס”י ס”י he raises a סתירה between two דברי הרא”ש. In ספר תורה סי ג brings a famous question of the Rishonim: We find that a קטן could accomplish an action lishma if he has an עומד על גביו, as we see by חליצה where the קטן can accomplish that mitzvah which requires לשם חליצה so long as there is an עומד על גביו. However, we find that a גט cannot be written by a קטן even with עומד על גביו and the reason given for this is because he won’t be able to concentrate on the lishma. The רא”ש answers this seeming contradiction by saying that the חליצה action takes but a moment to have lishma while taking off the shoe, whereas a גט takes a while to write, so the קטן is capable of having lishma by the former but not by the latter. The איש חזון asks on the

קטן עומד על גביו where he says that you could have פסחים פי כל שעה סי' כו in רא"ש by baking matzah lishma, which of course includes the whole process from kneading through baking. How could the קטן concentrate for such a long time there but not by כתיבת גט? The חזון איש says a yesod that by matzah it is enough to start off the process with lishma to fulfill the lishma requirement. Even if the rest of the baking is not lishma it is still good because of the סתמא לשמה קאי - כלל. You have to know when this כלל applies and where it doesn't, but the חזון איש says it does apply in baking matzah. [This סברא of applying קאי לשמה קאי to matzah baking is also mentioned by the מהרש"ם in קכט סי' קכט and similar תשובות are written on other similar issues including starting the writing of tefilin lishma in ה שלמה או"ח סי' ה and תשובות בית שאלה סי' ה. The סופר wants to even apply it to גט that one would only need the beginning of the כתיבה to be lishma.] So long as the ראשון כח of the matzah baking process was done lishma, then the rest of it can be done by machine. Therefore, in ישראל you find many chaburos try to fulfill חזון איש שיטת חזון איש by mixing the flour and water together and afterwards doing the rest of the process by machine.

The third היתר is ע"ג סי' רפאל, R' Refoel Volozhiner. He writes about the din in רנב סי' that if one poured kernels of wheat into a grinder on Shabbos and the grinder was powered by itself (either by wind, water, or nowadays electricity), that would constitute a full violation of טוחן because we say the whole completed action is attributed to the one who started it. Because the normal way to accomplish טוחן is with the assistance of the wind-powered (or otherwise) grinder, the entirety of the grinding is attributed to the one who poured in the grain. Furthermore, he says that if one puts the ingredients into the machine to bake the matzah- this also is attributed to him and causes the baking to be lishma because he empowered the process. The שואל argued with רפאל by saying that the entire sugya of that טוחן גמ' ב"ק דף only applies to Shabbos because of the principle brought in היזק גמ' to be saying that by היזק גמ' we have a higher standard than Shabbos, in that the person must physically do the damage ביד to be culpable whereas by the rest of Torah whatever is considered a מעשה בכל התורה כולה is a מעשה לגבי שבת.

The fourth and last היתר we will say here is that of סי' כ. He raises an interesting הערה: The Torah says שתהא שימור לשם מצוה לשם מצוה, which means to guard the dough from rising. It never says to knead the dough lishma nor does it say to bake the matzah lishma, it merely says to guard it lishma. This means one must simply set up a system of guards to make sure the dough is not מתחמץ and have in mind to be doing it lishma, while letting the machinery do all the kneading and baking work. The סופר asks in a teshuva in קכח - או"ח סי' קכח - why not use this סברא to allow חרש שוטה וקטן to knead and bake the matzah? As long as there are adults watching them lishma to make sure the dough doesn't rise. He answers that שמירה means that the שומר is in control to make sure nothing wrong happens to the object. By matzah, if the kneading stops even for a short amount of time it starts to

rise (as the רא"ש says) and therefore the watchman doesn't have proper control to prevent it, thereby disqualified as a שומר. Perhaps we can say by machine-matzah, they would be in perfect position to step in and immediately fix the machine or continue kneading so this would constitute proper שמירה and proper lishma. [Additionally, maybe we can suggest that setting up machines in a way that they should run smoothly would in itself be considered שמירה.] The מנחת חינוך ס"י also brings up this מהלך of setting up guards to make it lishma and brings up the principle (in חגיגה דף כ) of שביד חבירו of (חגיגה דף כ) one cannot be שומר on what someone else is holding. Even with this reason, machine-matzah could still be OK for three reasons:

1) That גמי refers only to that which is in another human being's hand (not a machine) because the other person is really in control, not the שומר. Machines on the other hand, are run by humans and therefore the שומר really is in control.

2) The מאירי on that גמי says outright that it is only applying to halachos of טומאה but it would be OK for matzah to have שביד חבירו (See the מאירי inside for his distinction.)

3) say the אור שמח פ"ט ה"י יז & מנחת ברוך ס"י ע"א סתמא גמי חגיגה is dealing with דמלתא when one was not specifically appointed to watch an object, that is when the principle applies. However, if one has direct intent to watch the object which his friend is holding, it is a תוספתא תוספתא that the שמירה will work. Therefore, if there were watchmen to guard the matzah lishma then even when they aren't personally kneading or baking it the matzah would have the proper lishma facet. The only big question against this היתר is רש"י in משנה נג. who explains את המצות ושמרתם as meaning one must knead the matzos lishma because the kneading prevents the dough from becoming chometz. brings this as a reason why simply watching the dough lishma would not be enough. (עוד עיין בזה שו"ת ארץ צבי סימן ה')

Even though this is only a jumping point into the sugya, everyone can look into the sources we brought to learn it more thoroughly and we wish everyone a מצות עשה דאורייתא and we should all be zoche to be mekayem the מצות עשה דאורייתא ובשמחה. בערב תאכלו מצות בהידור ובשמחה.